<u>META-ANALYSIS</u>

The Efficacy of Tiaoshen Acupuncture in Traditional Chinese Medicine for Insomnia Treatment: A Systematic Review and Meta-analysis

Weijun Luo, MM; Zhulin Wu, MD; Siyi Li, MD; Weiqing Zhang, MM; Mingbo Lai, MM; Zihao Lin, MD; Shuying Chen, MM; Zhuoxin Yang, PhD

ABSTRACT

Background • In recent years, Tiaoshen acupuncture in Traditional Chinese Medicine (TCM) has been employed for treating patients with insomnia, but the clinical efficacy remains to be substantiated.

Objective • To assess the efficacy and safety of acupuncture in treating insomnia using the Tiaoshen method in TCM. **Design** • A systematic review and meta-analysis was conducted. **Setting** • The research was conducted in Shenzhen.

Methods • Electronic databases, including Chinese National Knowledge Infrastructure (CNKI), Wanfang, SinoMed, Weipu, PubMed, Web of Science, EMBASE, and Cochrane databases, were retrieved up to September 15, 2023. Randomized controlled trials (RCTs) meeting inclusion criteria were screened. Quality assessment of included articles was performed using the Cochrane Risk of Bias tool. Valid data were then extracted and analyzed via meta-analysis using Review Manager 5.3. The study was registered in the International Platform of Registered Systematic Review and Meta-analysis Protocols (INPLASY), 2023100051.

Weijun Luo, MM; Siyi Li, MD; Weiqing Zhang, MM; Mingbo Lai, MM; Zihao Lin, MD; Shuying Chen, MM; Zhulin Wu, MD, Department of Traditional Chinese Medicine; People's Hospital of Longhua; Shenzhen, Guangdong; China. Zhuoxin Yang, PhD, The Fourth Clinical Medical College of Guangzhou University of Chinese Medicine (Shenzhen Traditional Chinese Medicine Hospital); Shenzhen, China.

Corresponding author: Zhulin Wu, MD E-mail: szwuzhulin@163.com Corresponding author: Zhuoxin Yang, PhD E-mail: szyangzhuoxin@qq.com

INTRODUCTION

Insomnia is a prevalent condition, with approximately one-third of the general population exhibiting symptoms of insomnia,¹ indicating a chronic progression. The prevalence of chronic insomnia is estimated to be between 10% and 15%, while transient insomnia ranges from 25% to 35% in **Results** • A total of 13 articles were included, comprising 849 patients with insomnia (diagnosed as chronic insomnia or primary insomnia). Meta-analysis results indicated that acupuncture with the Tiaoshen method could decrease the Pittsburgh Sleep Quality Index (PSQI) score [RR=-3.03, 95% CI (-3.73, -2.33), P < .00001], hyperarousal (HAS) scale score [RR=-7.75, 95% CI (-12.29, -3.22), P < .0008], and fatigue scale-14 (FS-14) score [RR=-2.11, 95% CI (-2.83, -1.38), P < .00001] compared with superficial acupuncture on non-effective acupoints or conventional acupuncture manipulation. Additionally, acupuncture with the Tiaoshen method demonstrated safety. However, the funnel plot suggested the presence of publication bias.

Conclusions • Acupuncture with the Tiaoshen method could enhance sleep quality and efficiency. Due to the low quality of some literature, further high-quality RCTs are needed to improve the level of evidence. (*Altern Ther Health Med.* 2024;30(12):132-138).

adults.^{2,3} This high occurrence is attributed to the numerous stressors faced by adults in modern society, such as job-related stress, financial pressures, and relationship issues.⁴ Prolonged insomnia can result in impaired daytime functioning, significantly impacting their quality of life.⁵

Sleep medication stands as the most commonly prescribed therapeutic agent in contemporary medicine. Owing to the chronic nature of insomnia, there is a growing reliance on sleeping pills for its treatment.⁶ Prolonged use of these medications may lead to side effects such as dizziness, daytime drowsiness, gastrointestinal disturbances, difficulty maintaining balance, and a tendency to develop drug dependence.⁷ Consequently, the timely, safe, and effective management of insomnia in patients and enhancing their quality of life hold significant importance in clinical practice.

Acupuncture involves needle puncture, a prominent therapeutic method in traditional Chinese medicine (TCM) for over 2500 years.⁸ It holds notable advantages in treating insomnia, demonstrating significant efficacy, safety, and simplicity. Studies indicate that the overall effectiveness rate of acupuncture, based on TCM pattern identification, surpasses that of medication.⁹ However, the efficacy of acupuncture is significantly influenced by clinicians' styles, with the stimulation of different acupoints using specific manipulations resulting in distinct curative effects.

Acupuncture for regulating the "Shen" has a history spanning 2000 years, dating back to its first mention in the ancient Chinese book "Lingshu." This historical reference underscores the significance of the "Shen" in acupuncture treatment for insomnia. According to TCM theory, sleep is intricately connected to the "Shen," which is controlled by the "heart" and resides within the five Zang Viscera. Sleep ensues when the "Shen" is calm, whereas restlessness in the "Shen" disrupts sleep. The term "Tiaoshen" signifies regulating the Shen and conveys the idea of spiritual cultivation.

The theory of Tiaoshen is rooted in the control and coordination of the functions of the five Zang Viscera by Shen in TCM, along with the balance and regulation of emotional activities. Acupoints proposed by Tiaoshen acupuncture include Baihui (GV20), Shenting (GV24), Sishencong (EX-HN1), Benshen (GB13), and Shenmen (HT7), among others. These acupoints, according to TCM theory, possess tranquilizing and heart-nourishing effects. In recent years, Tiaoshen acupuncture has been utilized in the treatment of insomnia, although its clinical efficacy still needs to be fully demonstrated.

Previous studies have presented conflicting findings regarding the use of Tiaoshen acupuncture in treating insomnia. Ma et al.¹⁰ reported no noteworthy change in the Pittsburgh Sleep Quality Index (PSQI) score when comparing insomnia patients to controls after undergoing Tiaoshen acupuncture therapy. In contrast, a separate study¹¹ observed a substantial difference in the PSQI scores of insomnia patients who received Tiaoshen acupuncture compared to those in the control group.

Therefore, it is imperative to combine previous findings to establish a more reliable reference. Our study aims to explore further the impact of Tiaoshen acupuncture in treating insomnia by selecting relevant randomized controlled trials (RCTs). The focus was placed on utilizing meta-analysis to thoroughly assess the existing literature, specifically on the application of Tiaoshen acupuncture for patients experiencing insomnia.

DATA AND METHODS Study Design

This study employed a precise research design, utilizing a systematic approach to investigate the efficacy of Tiaoshen acupuncture in treating insomnia. Only RCTs were selectively

acupuncture in treating insomnia. Only RCTs were selectively chosen; the emphasis was on examining the outcomes of Tiaoshen acupuncture interventions specifically tailored for patients with insomnia. The selected studies underwent thorough quality assessment using the Cochrane Risk of Bias tool. Valid data from these studies were then extracted and subjected to meta-analysis using Review Manager 5.3.

Inclusion Criteria

Type of Articles. The analysis exclusively considered RCTs. This study is duly registered in the International Platform of Registered Systematic Review and Meta-analysis Protocols (INPLASY) under registration number 2023100051. No ethical statement was considered necessary for this meta-analysis.

Participant Inclusion Criteria for Insomnia Studies. This meta-analysis included studies that focused on adult participants meeting diagnostic criteria for primary or chronic insomnia. The diagnostic methods covered various authoritative sources, including the Diagnostic and Statistical Manual of Mental Disorders,¹² the International Classification of Diseases,¹³ the Chinese Classification and Diagnostic Criteria of Mental Disorders,¹⁴ the Chinese Guideline for the Diagnosis and Treatment of Insomnia in Adults.¹⁵

Study Criteria and Treatment Protocols. The included studies centered on specific criteria. The treatment group underwent TCM Tiaoshen acupuncture, and studies were required to mention the utilization of Tiaoshen explicitly. In this investigation, the specified acupoints Encompassed Baihui (GV20), Shenting (GV24), Sishencong (EX-HN1), Benshen (GB13), or Shenmen (HT7). Conversely, the control group received treatment involving superficial acupuncturing on non-effective acupoints or conventional acupuncture manipulation.

Study Focus and Observation Indicators. The included studies centered on specific criteria for observation. The designated indicators were as follows: (1) Main observation indicator: included articles were required to report the PSQI score as the primary outcome measure; (2) Other observation indicators: additional metrics considered were the hyperarousal (HAS) scale score, fatigue scale-14 (FS-14) score, and corticosterone (CORT) index; (3) Safety, including adverse events, was evaluated descriptively.

Exclusion Criteria

The following criteria guided the exclusion of participants from the study: (1) Secondary insomnia: patients with insomnia attributed to organic diseases were excluded; (2) Severe mental disorders: individuals with severe mental disorders, such as schizophrenia, depressive disorders, and anxiety disorders, were omitted; (3) Intervention measures: cases where other treatments were employed as intervention measures were excluded; (4) Sleeping pills: participants undergoing interventions involving sleeping pills were not considered; (5) Repetitive or plagiarized literature: duplicate or plagiarized articles, as well as those with incomplete data, were excluded; (6) Language limitations: articles not in Chinese or English were excluded; (7) Review and animal experimental articles: studies falling under the categories of reviews or animal experiments were excluded from consideration.

Search Strategy

A comprehensive computer search was conducted across English and Chinese databases to gather relevant literature. English databases included PubMed, Cochrane Library, Embase, and Web of Science. Chinese databases encompassed the China Journal Full-text Database (CNKI), Wanfang Data, VIP Chinese Journal Full-text (VIP) Database, and China Biomedical Literature (CBM) Database. The search covered articles from the inception of the databases until September 15, 2023. The search terms employed were: "Sleep disorder OR insomnia," "Tiaoshen," and "randomized." This precise search strategy aimed to retrieve a robust selection of relevant articles for analysis.

Literature Screening and Quality Evaluation

Two authors independently carried out the selection of retrieved literature identified in the database search to minimize bias. The exclusion of irrelevant articles was determined through a thorough examination of titles and abstracts. Subsequently, the quality of the selected articles was carefully assessed, and the extracted study data was cross-compared. The methodological quality of RCTs was evaluated using the Cochrane Risk of Bias tool, comprising seven key items: random sequence generation, allocation concealment, participant and subject blinding, outcome assessment blinding, completeness of outcomes, outcome reporting bias, and other biases.¹⁶

The recorded quality of each study was categorized as "high risk," "unclear risk," or "low risk." Articles meeting all criteria were considered to have a low risk of bias, whereas those not meeting any criteria were considered to have a high risk of bias. Otherwise, articles were classified as having an unclear risk of bias. This process ensures a thorough evaluation of study quality, minimizing potential biases in the subsequent analysis.

Data Extraction

The authors devised a data extraction table to gather essential information from the literature, encompassing authors, publication year, case numbers, baseline characteristics, intervention methods, treatment duration, observation indicators, and adverse reactions to the interventions. The data were carefully organized using Excel 2010 software for systematic analysis.

Statistical Analysis

A meta-analysis was conducted to integrate the findings of the included articles using Review Manager 5.3. The Risk Ratio served as the effect size measure for dichotomous variables, while continuous variables utilized the mean difference (MD). This study exclusively dealt with continuous variables data, and the outcomes were computed with 95% confidence intervals (95% CIs). Additionally, the heterogeneity among articles was assessed through the I² test. If the *I*² value was below 50%, the fixed-effects model was employed for the analysis; for values exceeding 50%, either the random-effects model or descriptive analysis was conducted. The results of the meta-analysis were visually presented using a forest plot. P < .05 were considered significant, and a funnel plot was generated to analyze publication bias.

RESULTS

Literature Retrieval and Selection Process

A comprehensive search of the Chinese database yielded a total of 509 relevant articles, distributed as 213 from CNKI,



and selecting relevant articles based on predetermined criteria. 111 from Wanfang, 61 from VIP, and 124 from CBM. In the English databases, 8, 2, 10, and 11 articles were identified in PubMed, Web of Science, EMBASE, and the Cochrane Library, respectively. Adhering to the predetermined inclusion and

exclusion criteria, 13 Chinese randomized controlled trials^{10,11,17-27} were carefully chosen for further analysis.

Quality Assessment of Included Trials

Every trial incorporated in this study explicitly mentioned randomization. Among them, nine articles^{10,11,17,19,21,22,24,26,27} described the specific method for random sequence generation, and all employed random number table methods. Additionally, five articles^{11,19,21,26,27} provided details about specific allocation concealment methods utilizing the envelope method.

Three articles^{10,19,23} explained the blinding procedures for participants, personnel, and outcome assessment. Moreover, nine articles^{11,17-19,21-23,26,27} outlined their strategies for handling incomplete outcome data. The risk of selective reporting bias in ten articles^{10,11,17-19,21-23,26,27} was considered very low. However, in cases where other articles did not explicitly describe relevant aspects, they were categorized as "unclear." The risk of bias is visually represented in the risk of bias graph and summary in Figure 2 and Figure 3.

Baseline Characteristics and Treatment Protocols

Except for one study²⁰ that did not provide information on baseline characteristics, the other included articles consistently reported no significant differences in baseline characteristics, including gender, age, and observation indicators, between the

Table 1. The Basic Characteristics of the Included Studies

	· · · · · ·		r		r
	Sample	Intervention			Adverse
Study (Year)	(T/C)	(T/C)	Course	Indicators	Reactions
Huo et al. (2023)26	30/30	Baihui (GV20), Shenting (GV24), Sishencong (EX-HN1), Benshen (GB13), Shenmen (HT7), Neiguan (PC6), Sanyinjiao (SP6) / Superficial Acupuncturing	4W	13	NA
Gai et al. (2023)25	30/30	Shenting (GV24), Baihui (GV20), Sishenchong (EX-HN1), Shenmen (HT7), Shangwan (CV13), Zhongwan (CV12), Xiawan (CV10), Zusanli	4W	1	NA
		(ST36), Tianshu (ST25), Shenmai (BL62), Zhaohai (K16)/ Conventional Acupuncture		_	
Ma et al. (2022)10	11/16	Sishencong (EX-HN1), Shenting (GV24), Baihui (GV20)/ Superficial Acupuncturing	6W	1	V
Chen et al. (2022)17	50/49	Baihui (GV20), Shenting (GV24), Shuigou (GV26), Waiguan (TE5), Hegu (L14), Yangfu (GB38), Taichong (LR3)/ Conventional Acupuncture	4W	1	NA
Xi et al. (2021)11	29/29	Baihui (GV20), Shenting (GV24), Yintang (GV29), Shenmen (HT7), Sanyinjiao (SP6)/ Superficial Acupuncturing	4W	12	V
Li et al. (2021)21	30/30	Baihui (GV20), Shenting (GV24), Yintang (GV29), Shenmen (HT7), Sanyinjiao (SP6)/ Superficial Acupuncturing	4W	14	V
Zhao et al. (2021)23	29/27	Baihui (GV20), Yintang (GV29), Shenmen (HT7), Sanyinjiao (SP6)/ Superficial Acupuncturing	4W	124	NA
Xi et al. (2020)27	29/30	Baihui (GV20), Shenting (GV24), Yintang (GV29), Shenmen (HT7), Sanyinjiao (SP6)/ Superficial Acupuncturing	4W	14	V
Zhang et al. (2020)24	30/30	Sishencong (EX-HN1), Neiguan (PC6), Shenmen (HT7), Zhongwan (CV12), Xiawan (CV10)/ Conventional Acupuncture	20d	1	NA
Guo et al. (2019)18	56/56	Baihui (GV20), Shenting (GV24), Sishencong (EX-HN1), Benshen (GB13), Shenmen (HT7), Neiguan (PC6), Sanyinjiao (SP6)/ Superficial Acupuncturing	4W	13	V
Yuan et al. (2019)22	42/40	Baihui (GV20), Shenting (GV24), Sishencong (EX-HN1), Benshen (GB13), Shenmen (HT7), Neiguan (PC6), Sanyinjiao (SP6)/ Superficial Acupuncturing	4W	12	V
Li et al. (2017)20	30/27	Baihui (GV20), Shenting (GV24), Sishencong (EX-HN1), Benshen (GB13), Shenmen (HT7), Neiguan (PC6), Sanyinjiao (SP6)/ Superficial Acupuncturing	4W	13	NA
Guo et al. (2017)19	30/30	Baihui (GV20), Shenting (GV24), Sishencong (EX-HN1), Benshen (GB13), Neiguan (PC6), Sanyinjiao (SP6)/ Superficial Acupuncturing	4W	12	NA

Abbreviations: T, Treatment; C, Control; Observation Indicators: ① PSQI (Pittsburgh Sleep Quality Index), ② HAS (Hyperarousal Scale), ③ FS-14 (Fatigue Scale-14), ④ CORT (Cortisol) Level. NA represents unavailable.

Figure 2. Graphical Representation of Risk of Bias in Included Studies



Note: The risk of bias graph visually presents the assessment of methodological quality across various criteria in the included studies, providing an overview of potential biases and their distribution.



Note: The risk of bias summary provides a comprehensive overview of the methodological quality of the included studies, detailing specific criteria assessed. Types of bias considered include random sequence generation, allocation concealment, participant and subject blinding, outcome assessment blinding, completeness of outcomes, outcome reporting bias, and other potential sources of bias.

experimental group (receiving Tiaoshen acupuncture) and the control group. All patients in the experimental group underwent treatment with TCM Tiaoshen acupuncture. Conversely, the control group received conventional acupuncture manipulation or superficial acupuncturing on non-effective acupoints, including Shousanli (LI10), Binao (LI14), Jianyu (LI15), Futu (ST32), Feiyang (BL58), Yangchi (TE4), Fengshi (GB31), Waiguan (TE5), Liangqiu (ST34).

This study encompassed a total of 13 selected studies involving 849 patients with insomnia. The assessment included four observation indexes: PSQI score, HAS score,





Note: The pie diagram illustrates the frequency and distribution of acupoints used in the selected studies, providing an overview of the commonly targeted acupuncture points in the treatment of insomnia using the Tiaoshen method.



Note: The forest plot displays the results of the meta-analysis on PSQI scale scores. Each study's effect size is represented by a square, and the horizontal line through the square indicates the confidence interval. The diamond at the bottom signifies the overall effect size. The letters (A-G) correspond to specific components of the Cochrane risk of bias tool: A - Random Sequence Generation, B - Allocation Concealment, C - Participant and Subject Blinding, D - Outcome Assessment Blinding, E - Completeness of Outcomes, F - Outcome Reporting Bias, and G - Other Biases.

FS-14 score, CORT, and safety, refer to Table 1. The frequency distribution of acupoints is visually represented in the pie diagram presented in Figure 4.

Meta-analysis Results of Tiaoshen Acupuncture in Treating Insomnia

Tiaoshen Acupuncture's Impact on PSQI Scale Scores. The main indicator assessed in this meta-analysis was the PSQI scale score, with 13 articles^{10,11,17-27} included. The heterogeneity test demonstrated an I² of 83% (P < .00001), indicating high heterogeneity. Consequently, the random-



Note: The forest plot illustrates the meta-analysis results concerning HAS scale scores. A square represents each study's effect size, and the horizontal line through the square indicates the confidence interval. The diamond at the bottom reflects the overall effect size. The letters (A-G) correspond to specific components of the Cochrane risk of bias tool: A - Random Sequence Generation, B - Allocation Concealment, C - Participant and Subject Blinding, D - Outcome Assessment Blinding, E - Completeness of Outcomes, F - Outcome Reporting Bias, and G - Other Biases.

effect model was employed for the meta-analysis. The results, presented in the forest plot in Figure 5, illustrate that acupuncture utilizing the Tiaoshen method from TCM effectively reduces PSQI scale scores, signifying an enhancement in sleep quality (MD = -3.03; 95% CI = -4.31, -0.94; *P* for effect <.00001).

Reduced HAS Scale Scores with Tiaoshen Acupuncture. In this meta-analysis, we explored the reduction of the HAS score as an indicator of Tiaoshen Acupuncture efficacy. Four selected studies^{11,19,22,23} were considered for evaluation. The heterogeneity test yielded an I² of 82% (P = .0010), indicating substantial heterogeneity. Consequently, the random-effect model was applied for the meta-analysis. The outcome of the meta-analysis revealed that the application of acupuncture with the Tiaoshen method exhibited a notable reduction in the HAS score (MD = -7.75; 95% CI = -12.29, -3.22; P for effect <.0008). This effect was notably superior to that observed in the control group, as illustrated in Figure 6.

Enhanced FS-14 Scale Score with Tiaoshen Acupuncture. We investigated the meta-analysis and concentrated on diminishing the score of the FS-14. Three relevant studies^{18,20,26} provided insights into the FS-14 scale. The heterogeneity test indicated an I² of 25% (P = .27), signifying low heterogeneity. Consequently, the fixed-effect model was employed for the meta-analysis. The results revealed that the implementation of acupuncture with the Tiaoshen method exhibited a significant reduction in the FS-14 scale score (MD = -2.11; 95% CI = -2.83, -1.38; P for effect <.0001), as depicted in Figure 7.

CORT Index Improvement with Tiaoshen Acupuncture. We also conducted a meta-analysis assessing the enhancement of the CORT Index. Three included studies^{21,23,27} contributed information on the CORT index. The heterogeneity test revealed an I² of 0% (P = .64), indicating minimal heterogeneity. Consequently, the fixedeffect model was applied for the meta-analysis. The outcomes of the meta-analysis indicate that the application of acupuncture with the Tiaoshen method significantly decreased the score of the CORT index (MD = -59.23; 95% CI = -85.81, -32.65; P for effect < .0001), as illustrated in Figure 8.

Figure 7. Meta-analysis of FS-14 Scale Scores

	Tia	osher	1	C	ontrol			Mean Difference	Mean Difference	Risk of Bias
Study or Subgroup	Mean	SD	Total	Mean	SD	Total	Weight	IV, Fixed, 95% CI	IV, Fixed, 95% CI	ABCDEFG
Guojing2019	5.18	3.02	56	6.59	2.98	56	42.6%	-1.41 [-2.52, -0.30]	-	555566 5
Huoyishan2023	6.95	3.31	30	9.64	0.78	30	35.5%	-2.69 [-3.91, -1.47]	-	••??••?
Lihuangin2017	5.93	3.06	30	8.44	2.91	27	21.9%	-2.51 [-4.06, -0.96]		3333333
Total (95% CI)			116			113	100.0%	-2.11 [-2.83, -1.38]	•	
Heterogeneity: Chi2=	2.65, df	= 2 (P	= 0.27); 12=25	%					_
Test for overall effect	Z= 5.69) (P <)	0.00001	1)					-4 -2 U Z 4 Favours (Tiaoshen) Favours (control)	

Note: The forest plot depicts the meta-analysis outcomes related to FS-14 scale scores. Each study's effect size is represented by a square, with the horizontal line through the square indicating the confidence interval. The diamond at the bottom reflects the overall effect size. The letters (A-G) correspond to specific components of the Cochrane risk of bias tool: A - Random Sequence Generation, B - Allocation Concealment, C - Participant and Subject Blinding, D - Outcome Assessment Blinding, E - Completeness of Outcomes, F - Outcome Reporting Bias, and G - Other Biases.

Figure 8. Meta-analysis of the CORT Index

	Tiaoshen			Control			Mean Difference		Mean Difference	Risk of Bias
Study or Subgroup	Mean	SD	Total	Mean	SD	Total	Weight	IV, Fixed, 95% CI	IV, Fixed, 95% CI	ABCDEFG
Lijiahuan2021	298.02	97.73	30	365.19	125.53	30	21.8%	-67.17 [-124.10, -10.24]		••??••?
Xihanqing2020	272.84	90.73	29	352.78	127.49	27	20.8%	-79.94 [-138.27, -21.61]		••??••?
Zhaoyanan2021	360.38	72.22	29	409.11	64.91	30	57.4%	-48.73 [-83.81, -13.65]	+	??!!!! ?
Total (95% CI)			88			87	100.0%	-59.23 [-85.81, -32.65]	•	
Heterogeneity: Chi ² = 0.90, df = 2 (P = 0.64); P = 0% Test for overall effect. Z = 4.37 (P < 0.0001)									-100 -50 0 50 100 Favours (tiaoshen) Favours (con	troll

Note: The forest plot presents the meta-analysis findings concerning the CORT index. Each study's effect size is denoted by a square, and the horizontal line through the square indicates the confidence interval. The diamond at the bottom illustrates the overall effect size. The letters (A-G) correspond to specific components of the Cochrane risk of bias tool: A - Random Sequence Generation, B - Allocation Concealment, C - Participant and Subject Blinding, D - Outcome Assessment Blinding, E - Completeness of Outcomes, F - Outcome Reporting Bias, and G - Other Biases.



Note: The funnel plot provides an assessment of publication bias regarding the PSQI scale score. Each point represents a study, and the distribution of points is examined for symmetry. Asymmetry may indicate the presence of small-study effects or publication bias.

Publication Bias Analysis and Safety Evaluation

We utilized a funnel plot for analysis to evaluate the PSQI scale score indicator across the 13 included studies.^{10,11,17-27} Figure 9 illustrates a slightly asymmetrical distribution in the funnel plot, suggesting a potential publication bias or variability in study outcomes among the

analyzed studies. Furthermore, six studies^{10,11,18,21,22,27} documented the adverse reactions associated with the interventions. No adverse reactions were observed in any of the patients, and mild reactions such as skin allergy, dizziness, and hematoma were reported in individual cases. One study reported the incidence of subcutaneous ecchymosis in both groups, showing no significant difference.

DISCUSSION

Insomnia refers to a subjective experience characterized by dissatisfaction with sleep duration or quality, impacting functioning despite suitable sleep opportunities and conditions ^[28]. Globally, the prevalence of insomnia is estimated to be around 30% to 35%, and a survey conducted in 2005 indicated that 45.4% of respondents in China reported suffering from insomnia to varying degrees.^{29,30} While insomnia may spontaneously improve or disappear in the short term, it frequently evolves into chronic insomnia, highlighting its persistent nature.³¹

Insomnia is associated with an elevated risk of mental and medical disorders, including depression, hypertension, and cardiovascular diseases³² Furthermore, it impacts the quality of life for affected individuals and contributes to an increased economic burden on society. While modern medicine offers various targets for treating insomnia, including the use of multiple drugs, prolonged or unregulated usage of sleeping pills can lead to adverse effects such as hangovers, drug resistance, or dependence.³³ It underscores the importance and necessity of further research in the treatment of insomnia.

Previous studies have highlighted the advantages of nondrug therapies for insomnia, including safety, significant therapeutic effects, and minimal adverse reactions, making non-drug therapy a prominent area of research.³⁴ Recent studies have demonstrated the efficacy and safety of TCM Tiaoshen acupuncture in alleviating insomnia symptoms.^{11,22} This study comprehensively evaluated the clinical effectiveness and safety of TCM Tiaoshen acupuncture in treating insomnia, building upon its known advantages.

Our findings indicated that the methodological quality of the 13 studies included in this study was generally mediocre. Additionally, most studies lacked complete information, preventing further analysis of potential biases. This systematic review aimed to eliminate the interference of other intervention measures, ensuring the homogeneity of intervention methods for reliable results. The meta-analysis results demonstrated that acupuncture with the TCM Tiaoshen method could significantly reduce the scores of insomnia-related scales, such as PSQI, compared to conventional acupuncture manipulation or superficial acupuncturing non-effective acupoints. This finding suggests that TCM Tiaoshen acupuncture may contribute to the improvement of insomnia.

Among commonly used scales, the PSQI was developed to measure general sleep quality and is recommended for studying global insomnia. Additionally, some articles suggest that acupuncture with the Tiaoshen method is safe, but further research is required to explore its safety in the future. Concerning the primary observation indicator, the PSQI score, the funnel plot indicates a potential presence of smallstudy or publication bias. Furthermore, there was little change in the combined result and heterogeneity after systematically removing included studies one by one, indicating relatively strong stability in the meta-analysis results.

The high heterogeneity in certain outcome measures may stem from various factors. Inconsistencies in baseline data among the included studies and variations in the confounders adjusted for in each research contribute to this heterogeneity. Differences in the severity of insomnia among patients across studies also play a role. Additionally, variations in the acupoints used for Tiaoshen acupuncture contribute to heterogeneity. Currently, there is no standardized consensus on the sub-category of Tiaoshen acupuncture, preventing the implementation of subgroup analysis.

The meta-analysis results also indicated that TCM Tiaoshen acupuncture could decrease serum CORT index. This mechanism could be one of the ways by which TCM Tiaoshen acupuncture exerts its therapeutic effects on insomnia. As a significant stress hormone, CORT plays a crucial role in neuroendocrine regulation. Excessive CORT levels contribute to abnormal structural and functional connections in brain regions associated with mood regulation, potentially influencing insomnia symptoms.³⁵

Additionally, our frequency analysis revealed that Sanyinjiao may play a significant role as an associated acupoint in Tiaoshen acupuncture. Studies suggest that stimulating Baihui (DU20), Shenmen (HT7), and Sanyinjiao (SP6) can impact the cAMP/CREB/BDNF and PI3K/Akt pathways, reducing apoptosis in the central nervous system of insomnia rats.³⁶ However, there remains a gap in understanding the mechanisms of stimulating other acupoints, including Shenting (GV24), Sishencong (EX-HN1), and Benshen (GB13), in the treatment of insomnia. It presents an avenue for future research in the field of insomnia.

Study Limitations

A few limitations should be acknowledged in this metaanalysis. Firstly, the methodological quality of the included studies was generally deemed mediocre, with incomplete information and challenges in analyzing potential biases. It could impact the reliability of the results. Additionally, heterogeneity in outcome measures was noted, attributed to inconsistencies in baseline data, variations in adjusted confounders, and varying severity of insomnia among the studies. The lack of consensus on the sub-category of Tiaoshen acupuncture hindered subgroup analysis.

Moreover, the absence of a unified definition for Tiaoshen acupuncture acupoints, with Sanyinjiao emerging as a potential associated acupoint through frequency analysis, underscores the need for more comprehensive research. Finally, the funnel plot indicated potential small-study or publication bias, urging caution in interpreting the findings. These limitations highlight areas for improvement in future studies in this domain.

CONCLUSION

In conclusion, despite acknowledging potential biases indicated by high heterogeneity and asymmetrical funnel plots, the meta-analysis results consistently point towards the effectiveness of TCM Tiaoshen acupuncture in reducing PSQI score, HAS score, FS-14 score, and serum CORT index. These findings suggest a potential alleviation of insomnia symptoms through the application of Tiaoshen acupuncture. However, the limitations in sample size, literature quality, and the presence of publication bias underscore the need for further validation through high-quality, large-sample RCTs. Addressing these limitations will strengthen the evidence base and enhance the credibility of the observed therapeutic effects of Tiaoshen acupuncture in treating insomnia.

AUTHORS' DISCLOSURE STATEMENT

The authors declare there is no conflict of interest.

FUNDING

This study was supported by the Guangdong traditional Chinese medicine Shi Cheng Xinhuo Project and Special Subject of Medical Research of Longhua District Medical Association (2023LHMA14).

AUTHORS' CONTRIBUTIONS

Zhulin Wu and Zhuoxin Yang are regarded as co-corresponding authors

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

REFERENCES

- Zheng Y, Lv T, Wu J, Lyu Y. Trazodone changed the polysomnographic sleep architecture in insomnia disorder: a systematic review and meta-analysis. *Sci Rep.* 2022;12(1):14453. doi:10.1038/ s41598-022-18776-7
- Schotanus AY, Dozeman E, Ikelaar SLC, et al. Internet-delivered cognitive behavioural therapy for insomnia disorder in depressed patients treated at an outpatient clinic for mood disorders: protocol of a randomised controlled trial. *BMC Psychiatry*. 2023;23(1):75. doi:10.1186/s12888-022-04492-z
- Ohayon MM. Epidemiology of insomnia: what we know and what we still need to learn. Sleep Med Rev. 2002;6(2):97-111. doi:10.1053/smrv.2002.0186
- Zhou J, Wang H, Zou Z. Inverse Association between Dietary Diversity Score Calculated from the Diet Quality Questionnaire and Psychological Stress in Chinese Adults: A Prospective Study from China Health and Nutrition Survey. Nutrients. 2022;14(16):3297. doi:10.3390/nu14163297
- Kyle SD, Beattie L, Spiegelhalder K, Rogers Z, Espie CA. Altered emotion perception in insomnia disorder. Sleep. 2014;37(4):775-783. doi:10.5665/sleep.3588
- Yang CM, Lai YS, Huang YH, Huang YC, Lee HC. Predicting Hypnotic Use among Insomnia Patients with the Theory of Planned Behavior and Craving. *Behav Sci (Basel)*. 2022;12(7):209. doi:10.3390/bs12070209
- Yang CW, Li CI, Li TC, et al. Combined Effects of Having Sleep Problems and Taking Sleeping Pills on the Skeletal Muscle Mass and Performance of Community-Dwelling Elders. Sci Rep. 2019;9(1):13760. doi:10.1038/s41598-019-50295-w
- 8. NIH Consensus Conference. Acupuncture. JAMA. 1998;280(17):1518-1524.
- Kim SH, Jeong JH, Lim JH, Kim BK. Acupuncture using pattern-identification for the treatment of insomnia disorder: a systematic review and meta-analysis of randomized controlled trials. *Integr Med Res.* 2019;8(3):216-226. doi:10.1016/j.imr.2019.08.002
- Ma Y, Pang R, Teng R, et al. Effect of scalp acupuncture on sleep quality in patients with chronic insomnia. Journal of Changchun University of Chinese Medicine. 2022;38(12):1358-1362. doi:10.13463/j.cnki.cczyy.2022.12.014
- Xi HQ, Wu WZ, Liu CY, et al. [Effect of acupuncture at *Tiaoshen* acupoints on hyperarousal state in chronicinsomnia]. *Zhongguo Zhenjiu*. 2021;41(3):263-267. doi:10.13703/j.0255-2930.20200303-k0004
- First MB. Diagnostic and statistical manual of mental disorders, 5th edition, and clinical utility. J Nerv Ment Dis. 2013;201(9): 727-729. doi:10.1097/MND.0b013e3182a2168a.
- Janca A, Hiller W. ICD-10 checklists--a tool for clinicians' use of the ICD-10 classification of mental and behavioral disorders. Compt Psychiatry. 1996;37(3):180-187. doi:10.1016/S0010-440X(96)90034-6
- Chen YF. Chinese classification of mental disorders (CCMD-3): towards integration in international classification. *Psychopathology*. 2002;35(2-3):171-175. doi:10.1159/000065140
 Sleep Disorder Section, Neurology Branch, Chinese Medical Association. Chinese guideline for
- the diagnosis and treatment of insomnia in adults (2017). Chin J Neurol. 2018;51(5):324-335. doi:10.3760/cma.j.issn.1006-7876.2018.05.002
- Higgins JP, Altman DG, Gøtzsche PC, et al; Cochrane Bias Methods Group; Cochrane Statistical Methods Group. The Cochrane Collaboration's tool for assessing risk of bias in randomised trials. *BMJ*. 2011;343(oct18 2):d5928. doi:10.1136/bmj.d5928
- Chen B, Wang K, Zhang Y, et al. Clinical effect observation on Jieyu Tiaoshen Acupuncture treating insomnia of liver depression and qi stagnation syndrome. *China Journal o f Traditional Chinese Medicine and Pharmacy*. 2022;37(9):5530-5533.
- Guo J, Hu J, Zhang F, et al. Clinical study on the effect of "tiaoshen" Acupuncture on Heart rate variability in Primary Insomnia. *Global Traditional Chinese Medicine*. 2019;12(12):1877-1880.
- Guo J, Tang C, Wang L. Effect of Tiaoshen Acupuncture Therapy on Sleep Quality and Hyperarousal State in Primary Insomnia. JOURNAL OF CLINICAL ACUPUNCTURE AND MOXIBUSTIO. 2017;33(6):1-4.

- Li H, Zou Y, Guo J, et al. Treatment of 30 cases of Primary Insomnia with Zhou's "tiaoshen" Acupuncture. Global Traditional Chinese Medicine. 2017;10(7):882-885.
- Li JH, Wu WZ, Liu CY, et al. [Effect of Tiaoshen needling on plasma melatonin and cortisol in patients with chronic insomnia]. *Zhen Ci Yan Jiu*. 2021;46(8):690-694. doi:10.13702/j.1000-0607.201009
- Yuan F, Guo J. Clinical study on acupuncture treatment of patients with primary insomnia based on "Zhoujing Yeming" theory. *Zhonghua Zhongyiyao Zazhi*. 2019;34(12):5993-5996.
 Zhao Y, Wu W, Wang X, et al. To Observe the Effect of Tiaoshen Acupuncture on Hyperarousal
- Zhao Y, Wu W, Wang X, et al. To Observe the Effect of Tiaoshen Acupuncture on Hyperarousal in Patients with Chronic Insomnia. Modernization of Traditional Chinese Medicine and Materia Medica-World Science and Technology. 2021;23(7):2538-2543.
- Zhang D, Cai G, Song Y, et al. Clinical Research on Regulating Shen and Disharmonizing Stomach in the Treatment of Insomnia of Disharmony of Spleen and Stomach. JOURNALOFCLINICALACUPUNCTUREAND MOXIBUSTIO. 2020;36(5):9-12.
- Gai X. Evaluation of clinical effect of regulating the mind and stomach acupuncture on primary insomnia. *Contemporary Medical Essays.* 2023;21(10):171-173. doi:10.3969/j.issn.2095-7629.2023.10.053
- Huo YS, Chen ZY, Yin XJ, et al. [*Tiaoshen* acupuncture for primary insomnia: a pilot randomized controlledtrial].*Zhongguo22henjiu*.2023;43(9):1008-1013.doi:10.13703/j.0255-2930.20221120-0001
- Xi HQ, Wu WZ, Liu CY, et al. [Effect of Tongdu Tiaoshen needling in treatment of chronic insomnia by regulating the hypothalamic-pituitary-adrenal axis]. Zhen Ci Yan Jiu. 2020;45(7):552-556. doi:10.13702/j.1000-0607.190791
- Ren CY, Liu PP, Li J, et al. Changes in telomere length and serum neurofilament light chain levels in female patients with chronic insomnia disorder. J Clin Sleep Med. 2022;18(2):383-392. doi:10.5664/jcsm.9574
- Morin CM, Drake CL, Harvey AG, et al. Insomnia disorder. Nat Rev Dis Primers. 2015;1(1):15026. doi:10.1038/nrdp.2015.26
- Soldatos CR, Allaert FA, Ohta T, Dikeos DG. How do individuals sleep around the world? Results from a single-day survey in ten countries. *Sleep Med.* 2005;6(1):5-13. doi:10.1016/j. sleep.2004.10.006
- Cho CH, Jee HJ, Nam YJ, An H, Kim L, Lee HJ. Temporal association between zolpidem medication and the risk of suicide: A 12-year population-based, retrospective cohort study. Sci Rep. 2020;10(1):4875. doi:10.1038/s41598-020-61694-9
- Liu CS, Chen L, Hu YN, et al. Self-Microemulsifying Drug Delivery System for Improved Oral Delivery and Hypnotic Efficacy of Ferulic Acid. Int J Nanomedicine. 2020;15:2059-2070. doi:10.2147/IJN.S240449
- Morin CM, Inoue Y, Kushida C, Poyares D, Winkelman J; Guidelines Committee Members; Governing Council of the World Sleep Society. Endorsement of European guideline for the diagnosis and treatment of insomnia by the World Sleep Society. *Sleep Med.* 2021;81:124-126. doi:10.1016/j.sleep.2021.01.023
- Dopheide JA. Insomnia overview: epidemiology, pathophysiology, diagnosis and monitoring, and nonpharmacologic therapy. Am J Manag Care. 2020;26(4)(suppl):S76-S84. doi:10.37765/ ajmc.2020.42769
- Liu C, Zhao Y, Qin S, Wang X, Jiang Y, Wu W. Randomized controlled trial of acupuncture for anxiety and depression in patients with chronic insomnia. *Ann Transl Med.* 2021;9(18):1426. doi:10.21037/atm-21-3845
- Cao F, Xu Y, Zhang M, et al. Baihui (DU20), Shenmen (HT7) and Sanyinjiao (SP6) target the cAMP/CREB/BDNF and PI3K/Akt pathways to reduce central nervous system apoptosis in rats with insomnia. *Heliyon*. 2022;8(12):e12574. doi:10.1016/j.heliyon.2022.e12574